

Short listing of EOIs for the "Review/Updating of Development Statistics of Sindh for Bureau of Statistics, Sindh" under TA Component of Sindh Public Sector Management Reform Project, IDA Credit No: 5584-PK

Sr. No	Name of Firm/ Detailed Name and associations / JV	Address	Eligibility	Evaluation Criteria			Evaluation Remarks	Recommendation
				Profile of the firm (10 Marks)	Work Experience of the firm (40 Marks)	Qualification and Experience of Team (50 Marks)		
3	EY Ford Rhodes	EY Ford Rhodes Chartered Accountants, 6th Floor, Progressive Plaza, Beaumont Road, P.O. Box 15541, Karachi, 75530, Pakistan. Tel: +9221 35650007-11 Fax: +9221 35681965 Email: eyfrsh.khi@pk.ey.com Web: www.ey.com	<p>(i) Registration & Accreditation of the Firm</p> <p>(ii) Tax Authorities registration (FBR & SRB)</p> <p>(iii) Financial Statements for 03 years</p>	<p>(i) Above 05 years experience in consulting business (10 Marks)</p> <p>(ii) Upto 05 years experience in consulting business (05 Marks)</p>	<p>(i) Experience on similar assignments-Statistical Publications, etc -Minimum 05 projects (40 Marks)</p> <p>(ii) Experience on similar assignments-Statistical Publications, etc-Minimum 03 projects (30 Marks)</p> <p>(iii) Experience on similar assignments-Statistical Publications, etc-Minimum 02 publications (25 Marks)</p> <p>(iv) Experience on similar assignments-Statistical Publications, etc-Minimum 01 publication (20 Marks)</p>	<p>(i) Qualification & Experience of Team Leader-30 Marks (PhD/MPhil/MS in Economics/Statistics/Development Studies; 05 years experience for PhD, 07 for MPhil and 10 years for Masters)</p> <p>(ii) Team Members-10 Marks (Experience in Research and Policy-related assignments in government departments) At least 05 research publications in well-reputed journals (10 Marks) Less than 05 research publications in well-reputed journals (05 Marks)</p> <p>(i) Team Members-10 Marks (Experience in Public Sector Budgeting or Planning and Development)</p>	The firm stands qualified.	First (Technical & Financial Proposals may be called upon)
4	The Urban Unit (Urban Sector Planning & Management Services)	The Urban Unit 503-Shaheen Complex, Egerton Road, Lahore, Pakistan Ph: 042-99205316-22; Fax: 042-99205323 Email: uspmu@punjab.gov.pk www.urbanunit.gov.pk	<p>I. The Urban Unit was founded/registered in the year 2012. The Urban Unit is registered as a Public/Private/Partnership Company under Section 42 of Company Act. (a) Registered with FBR with NTN: 4107958-2. Registered with PEC, SECP, PSEB and other authorities.</p> <p>(II) MDC is registered with relevant authorities (SECP, FBR, SRB, PEC) as a consultancy providing various services to diverse sectors with NTN: 2632494-6 and SRTN: S2632494-6.</p> <p>III. The JV has provided its audited financial statements for last three years (2017,2018 and 2019) with a combined revenue turnover of over PKR 100 Million.</p>	<p>(I) The firm has submitted its EOI in a Joint-Venture with Management & Development Center (MDC), while being the lead partner/ The Urban Unit is engaged in multiple sectors with key including urban planning, urban design and architecture; institutional development and capacity building, urban economics and municipal finance, solid waste management, water & sanitation, urban transport & connectivity, information & communication technology, GIS & remote sensing, data collection, data analysis, marketing & communication, environmental & social safeguards, Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E).</p> <p>MDC has expertise in multiple sectors such as natural resource management, education, health, hygiene and sanitation, environment, HRM, gender development, disaster management, rural development, poverty reduction, etc.</p> <p>(II) The JV has worked with all national and provincial levels in Pakistan and has worked on multiple donor funded projects as Consultants- (10 Marks)</p>	<p>II. (a) The JV has undertaken numerous assignments in the public sector and shared their experience however they are mostly related to infrastructure, governance support programs. The projects involve huge Capital Amount but are less related to Statistical Analysis, Development Studies, Monitoring & Evaluation, strategy development, Identification and Review of Relevant policies as required under the ToRs.</p> <p>(b) The JV have listed relevant experiences such as Punjab Spatial Strategy, Asset Management of Pakistan Railways Land by GIS, GIS based UIPT system, Census of Manufacturing Industries (Relevant), GIS based census of health care establishments (HCDEs) in Punjab, Restructuring of EPA Punjab, Agriculture Plan, etc. MDC has relevant experience in Implementation of E-Governance in Livestock Department, Local Government Strengthening Activity, Water Safety Plan for Hyderabad, M&E of Project Impact and Supervision of Environmental Management Plan, M&E Consultant-SAGP.</p> <p>(II) The JV has listed only two assignments that involve surveys/census leading to statistical publications of a similar nature required at BoS, Sindh- (25 Marks)</p>	<p>I. Team Leader: (a) Dr. Ghulam Moheyuddin: Phd in Economics (b) 13 years experience in economics, research, urban and development economics, forecasting, policy advice and teaching. (c) Worked on multiple assignments in public sector and with donor partners to bring about reforms in multiple sectors- 30 Marks</p> <p>II (A) Team Members: The Team Members proposed for the assignment are well-qualified with good experience in related sectors. They have exposure research publications, including international publications. (i) The team includes an expert in Agriculture Economics with a PhD in Agriculture Education Extension and more than 25 years experience on similar assignments. (ii) The team includes a Statistician with a PhD in Agricultural Education and Extension and working as an Associate Professor at SAU, Tandojam with more than 10 years experience in research- 10 Marks (Moreover, there are also few other PhD qualified professionals in the proposed team)</p> <p>III (A) Team Members: The JV has a team of experts in various sectors experts and the team members have relevant experience and exposure in public sector budgeting and planning and development, as demonstrated by their involvement in diverse development schemes- 10 Marks</p>	The firm stands qualified.	Second

Deputy Secretary (SS),
Bureau of Statistics (BoS), Planning & Development
Department,
Government of Sindh/ Member

Representative on behalf of
DS (B&A) SG&CA Department,
Government of Sindh/ Member

Director (ERU), Finance Department, GoS/
Project Director, Sindh Public Sector Management Reform Project/

Representative on behalf of Chief (Foreign Aid), Section
Planning & Development Department,
Government of Sindh/ Member

Procurement & Contract Management Specialist,
ERU, Finance Department,
Government of Sindh/ Secretary

Short listing of EOIs for the "Review/Updating of Development Statistics of Sindh for Bureau of Statistics, Sindh" under TA Component of Sindh Public Sector Management Reform Project, IDA Credit No: 5584-PK

Sr. No	Name of Firm/ Detailed Name and associations / JV	Address	Eligibility	Evaluation Criteria			Evaluation Remarks	Recommendation
				Profile of the firm (10 Marks)	Work Experience of the firm (40 Marks)	Qualification and Experience of Team (50 Marks)		
			(i) Registration & Accreditation of the Firm (ii) Tax Authorities registration (FBR & SRB) (iii) Financial Statements for 03 years	(i) Above 05 years experience in consulting business (10 Marks) (ii) Upto 05 years experience in consulting business (05 Marks)	(i) Experience on similar assignments-Statistical Publications, etc - <i>Minimum 05 projects</i> (40 Marks) (ii) Experience on similar assignments-Statistical Publications, etc - <i>Minimum 03 projects</i> (30 Marks) (iii) Experience on similar assignments-Statistical Publications, etc - <i>Minimum 02 publications</i> (25 Marks) (iv) Experience on similar assignments-Statistical Publications, etc - <i>Minimum 01 publication</i> (20 Marks)	(i) Qualification & Experience of Team Leader-30 Marks (<i>PhD/MPhil/MS in Economics/Statistics/Development Studies; 05 years experience for Ph.D, 07 for MPhil and 10 years for Masters</i>) (i) Team Members-10 Marks (<i>Experience in Research and Policy-related assignments in government departments</i>) <i>At least 05 research publications in well-reputed journals</i> (10 Marks) <i>Less than 05 research publications in well-reputed journals</i> (05 Marks) (i) Team Members-10 Marks (<i>Experience in Public Sector Budgeting or Planning and Development</i>).		
1	APEX Consulting	APEX Consulting Pakistan, 01st Floor, Kashmir Plaza near PIA Office, AK Faizal ul Haq Road, Blue Area, Islamabad, Pakistan. www.apexconsulting.biz Ph: +92 (51) 8437530	I. (a) APEX Consulting Pakistan (APEX) was founded in August, 2002. (b) APEX is registered in Lahore, Pakistan under section 58 (1) of the Partnership Act, 1932. (c) It has branches in major cities of Pakistan as well as International offices in Afghanistan and Canada. II. (a) Registered with FBR for WHT and GST with NTN - 1428225-9. (b) Registered with SRB for SST with SSTRN: 1428225-9 III. The firm has provided its audited financial statements for last three years (2017,2018 and 2019) with a consistent revenue turnover of over PKR 50 Million and average PAT of around PKR 5 Million.	The firm has multiple services lines including Research, Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E), Human Resource Management, Small Infrastructure, Media Monitoring. I. (a) The firm has more than 10 years experience in provision of consultancy services in diverse sectors such as Health, Agriculture, Education with expertise in Institutional Assessment, Financial and HR Management. Moreover, the firm has been involved with multiple assignments in the public sector and has good experience of working with international donor partners. (b) The firm has worked with all provincial governments in Pakistan and has worked on UNICEF projects in Sindh as a Third-party Monitoring consultant. (10 Marks)	II. (a) APEX has undertaken numerous assignments involving areas such as Quality Assurance, Post-Campaign Monitoring & Evaluation, Diverse Surveys, Third-party overseeing, Stakeholders analysis, strategy development, Identification and Review of Relevant policies related to community development plans, etc. (b) APEX has however, shared 04 related assignments that involve surveys leading to statistical publications of a similar nature required at BoS, Sindh. They are: (i) <i>Bureau of Stats (BoS)-Punjab: Economic and Social Well-Being Survey in Punjab (2017-18)</i> (ii) <i>Bureau of Stats (BoS)-Punjab: Hepatitis Prevalence Survey in Punjab 2017</i> (iii) <i>Socioeconomic Baseline Survey in Sindh for NRSP, TRDP and SRSP</i> (iv) <i>Post KAP Survey on Infant, Young Child Feeding Practices and Behaviors in Three Districts of Sindh Province.</i> (35 Marks)	I. <u>Team Leader:</u> (a) <i>Dr. Aisha Sehar Zafar</i> : A Medical Doctor, Clinical Dietitian and Nutritionist with Masters' in Public Health Research and Nutrition specific development initiative. (b) 15 years experience in public health program development and management. (c) She has worked as a Program Manager, Researcher and Independent Development Specialist. However, her qualifications do not match the requirements set out in the ToRs in the assignment- 10 Marks II (A). <u>Team Members:</u> The team members proposed for the assignment are all well-qualified with good experience in their respective areas however, none of them has provided the evidence of research publications in policy-related matters in government departments, as required in the ToRs- 02 Marks III (A). <u>Team Members:</u> Similarly, none of the team members has demonstrated experience of dealing with public sector budgeting and planning and development, as required in the ToRs. 03 Marks	The firm stands qualified	Third
				10	35	15	60	
2	B.M Consulting Engineers	B.M Consulting Engineers (Pvt) Ltd Office No. 5, 4th Floor, Dean Arcade, Plot No. DC-4, Block-8, Clifton, Karachi. Tel: 021-35344182-4 bmcpak@gmail.com	I. (a) BM Consulting Engineers was founded in 2006. (b) BM Consulting is registered with SECP vide registration no. 0077387. Registered with PEC with Reg No. CONSULT/1532. Registered for ISO 9001:2015 QMS. II. (a) Registered with FBR with NTN : 3962485-4 III. The firm has provided its audited financial statements for last three years (2017,2018 and 2019) with a consistent revenue turnover of over PKR 50 Million and average PAT of over PKR 2.5 Million.	The firm is a professional group of civil/structural engineers, management experts and resource persons in various disciplines specializing in different aspects of civil/structural engineering and project management. The firm has major fields of specialization related to Civil Engineering, Town Planning, Mapping, Geology, EIA, etc. I. (a) The firm has more than 25 years experience in provision of engineering and project management services in diversified disciplines, with multiple assignment in Sindh. (b) However, the firm experience is primarily based around engineering tasks, providing both normal and specialized services in the sector. (05 Marks)	II. (a) BM Consulting has undertaken numerous projects with concentration in civil engineering sector involving areas such as Feasibility Studies, Soil & Investigation Testing, Hydrological Investigations, Engineering Studies, AUTO CAD/Manual Drawings, Tender Documents, BoQs, Cost Estimates, Construction Supervision and Quality Control, Contract Administration, Project Monitoring & Evaluation, Conclusion of Agreements, Performance Evaluation, Training Services, Geological Studies, GIS-based mapping, Master Planning, Town Planning and Environment Impact Assessment. (b) The firm has however, has not been involved in assignments that involve surveys leading to statistical publications of a similar nature required at BoS, Sindh. (15 Marks)	I. <u>Team Leader:</u> (a) <i>Bashir Ahmed Dahar</i> : B.E (Civil), Chairman/Member (Federal)-IRSA, GoP, Secretary-Irrigation & Power Department, GoS. (b) More than 30 years experience of working on multiple assignments in the public sector with expertise in leading projects and specialization in areas of planning, feasibility, project managing, administration, resource management related to civil engineering, agriculture resource management, etc. However, her qualifications do not match the requirements set out in the ToRs in the assignment- 10 Marks II (A). <u>Team Members:</u> The team members proposed for the assignment are all well-qualified with good experience in their respective areas however, none of them has provided the evidence of research publications in policy-related matters in government departments, as required in the ToRs- 02 Marks III (A). <u>Team Members:</u> The team members have relevant experience and exposure in public sector budgeting and planning and development, as demonstrated by their involvement in diverse development schemes in Sindh- 08 Marks	The firm is dis-qualified	Fourth
				5	15	20	40	

Deputy Secretary (SS),
Bureau of Statistics (BoS), Planning &
Development Department,
Government of Sindh/ **Member**

Representative on behalf of
DS (B&A), SG&CA Department,
Government of Sindh/ **Member**

Director (ERU), Finance Department, GoS/
Project Director, Sindh Public Sector Management Reform Project/
Chairman

Representative on behalf of Chief (Foreign Aid) Section,
Planning & Development Department,
Government of Sindh/ **Member**

Procurement & Contract Management Specialist,
ERU, Finance Department,
Government of Sindh/ **Secretary**